[श्री मौलाना ओबेदुल्ला खान आजमी]

उस पर अमल करने के लिए कड़े कदम उठाए। हमेशा फार्मेल्टी पूरी होती है, चाहे किसी म.पी. के साथ बेहूदगी हो रही है, किसी के साथ जेल में तमाशा हो रहा है, किसी को यहां तबाह किया जा रहा है, किसी को वहां तबाह किया जा रहा है। तो यह फार्मेल्टी सब खतम होनी चाहिए। हम फामल्टी नहीं चाहते। हम सिद्दत के साथ इनकी हिमायत करते हुए अपराधियों के लिए सजा का ताअयुन चाहते हैं।

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENTS ADDRESS—Contd.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): We will have further discussion on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. Shri V. Narayanasamy to continue.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Thank you very much Mr. Vice-Chairman for giving this opportunity to continue the discussion. Yesterday, I was refering to (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please try to restore normalcy in the House....(Interruptions) ....Please try to restore normalcy in the House.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, yesterday I was referring to the Ayodhya incident and its aftermath and I made an appeal to all the secular political parties and its leaders ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Who are they?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Including Mr. Upendra.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): To what party Mr. Upendra belong?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I made an appeal to all the secular parties and its leaders to forget all the differences and try to settle the issue of Ram Mandir and Masjid because the BJP has not only been isolated, but they have been hijacked by *Sanths* and *Mahants*. The BJP is being dictated by the *Sangh Parivar* and the other communal organisations which are attached to them. Sir, I was actually pained when Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi, the President of the BJP and a senior and honourable Member of this House, was distorting the facts which we had known earlier. But the opinion of the other BJP leaders is different. Dr. Joshi was telling the Press in Anantpur that they wanted the Babri Masjid to be demolished. That was the intention of the BJP and, with that intention, they took advantage of the Sangh Pariwar for the purpose of executing that intention. Sir, I am also pained to note that the very same leader, who is the President of that party, was telling, "I have no faith in the minorities.". In our country, all the communities, majority or minority, have been living in harmony and we want peace in this country. We want development in this country and we do not want this country to be ruined in the name of religion or caste or creed. One political party, which has tasted increased representation in Parliament in the 1990 and 1991 elections, is using the Hindu card for the purpose of destroying the democratic fabric of this country. Therefore, an appeal has been made by the honourable Prime Minister that the secular parties have to come together and they have to see that the country's development is given priority, the foremost importance, than any other thing and the honourable Prime Minister has also said that the country's development is the main concern of all of us and, so, a moratorium can be considered. But I saw the response of the BJP leaders which was very cold. They have been telling that they will construct the Ram Mandir in the disputed place. "Ram" is not the property of the BJP or the Sangh Pariwar alone. Lord Rama is worshipped by the people of the Hindu religion and the BJP and the VHP are taking the responsibility for constructing the Mandir which no one in this country

will accept. A true sentimental Hindu will not accept one particular organization claiming that it will construct the Mandir and this will not be accepted by the people at all. Therefore, the Government has announced, and the honourable Prime Minister has said very categorically and in clear terms, that the Government will create a Trust. It has also been said that they will consult all the important leaders, especially the religious heads, for the purpose of helping in the construction of the Mandir and the Masjid. The Prime Minister has said that he will take the aid and advice of the leaders of the Muslim community for the construction of the Masjid. This has been going on for more than five or six months and the BJP has been raising the issue of the Ram Mandir on account of which development has been relegated to the background. Economic development, about which everybody is talking here these days, should be given the prime importance in this country. The Communist Parties have been telling that in this country development has to take place. Now, in China, they have got an open economy, the market economy. That being the case, I urge upon the leaders of all the secular parties, the non-BJP parties, to co-operate with the Government for the purpose of developing this country in the economic field.

AN HON. MEMBER: In development, they are co-operating.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The BJP will not co-operate. I am definite about it....(Interruptions)...If they cooperate with us why should they go to the extent of inflaming communalism in this country, in various parts of this country?

I saw the statements made by various political leaders. All the political leaders have been condemning the BJP for the communal holocaust in this country.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttar Pradesh): All are afraid of BJP.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We are not afraid of BJP. We do not want the communal virus to spread in this country. Communal virus should not be spread in the country by the BJP in the name of religion.

Sir, the BJP leaders have announced a rally. They had been telling that on the 25th of February, they would have a very mammoth rally in Delhi. They said that more than ten lakhs would gather. Sir, what are their demands? They have made very peculiar demands. They said that the Lok Sabha should be dissolved and a mid-term poll should take place. They said that in all the four States where the BJP Government were dismissed, elections should be held immediately. They said that the ban on the communal organisations — the VHP, the Bajrang Dal and the RSS —should be lifted. And they wanted that the BJP should be allowed to function as a political party. They said that a restriction was imposed by the Government and that they would like to seek the opinion of the people, the support of all the people on all these demands. Sir, we knew and we came to know, and we have witnessed also what the response was for, the BJP's rally on the 25th of February in spite of the Government's ban. The Government has rightly banned the rally, and it was supported by all the secular political leaders. And not even 2,000 could gather for the purpose of agitation. (Interruptions). I have the firgures of the people who have been arrested. Where is ten lakhs and where is 2,000? This is the strength of the BJP rally which they wanted to hold in Delhi. And it was admitted by some BJP leaders also that it was a flop. (*interruptions*).

श्री कैलाश नरायण सारंग (मध्य प्रदेश) : इनको ख्वाब में भी दीखती है बी०जे०पी० । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

श्री लक्खीराम अग्रवाल (मध्यप्रदेश) : बी०जे०पी० का बुखार चढ़ गया है आपको . . . **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): फिर इलेक्शन क्यों नहीं कराते हैं यह ? ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आपने ऐसा क्यों इंतजाम किया था। आपका एस्टीमेट कितना गलत है कि दो हजार को पकड़ने के लिए तो इतना इंतजाम किया था। ... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सैयद सिब्ते रजी) : आप लोगों को भी वक्त मिलेगा। ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, थोड़ा सा आप बढ़वा दीजिए। ... (**व्यवधान**)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Narayanasamy, you carry on.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: When the Government took a decision to ban the rally, it was implemented in right earnest. Sir, here I would like to submit to the hon. Members of this House that inconvenience has been caused to the public. I agree with that. And inconvenience has been caused to the hon. Members of Parliament also. I feel sorry for it. But, Sir, the biggest virus, the communal virus which the BJP wanted to spread in this country has to be contained by the Government only in that way, by taking strong steps. The BJP's communal virus can be contained and controlled only by that way. Therefore, the Government's stand was right. And I thank all the other political parties who have been supporting the Government on this issue because they have taken up a right cause for the purpose of seeing that the BJP's communal virus is not spread throughout the country.

Sir, having dwelt upon this issue, the hon. President has mentioned in his Address about the achievements of this Government. Sir, about the Jammu and Kashmir issue, though we have discussed the issue yesterday elaborately, I would like to submit that the Government is taking all possible steps for starting a political process in Jammu and Kashmir. Sir, here again, when we wanted to bring normalcy in Jammu and Kashmir, when we wanted to contain terrorism there, when we wanted to see that the people of Jammu and Kashmir live peacefully, there also, the BJP wanted to play politics. They wanted article 370 to be removed, which gives a special status to Jammu and Kashmir, and this point was answered by the hon. Home Minister yesterday. Multi-party committees have been formed by the Government and they are functioning effectively. Not only that, an Advisory Council has also been formed and a Parliamentary delegation visited Srinagar to have the first-hand information about the state of affairs prevailing there.

I do not claim that we have completely controlled militancy in the State of Jammu and Kashmir but we are taking all possible steps to see that normalcy is restored in that State and free and fair elections are held there. Militants are on the run in Jammu and Kashmir and nobody can deny it. The Government wants that people in Jammu and Kashmir — whether they are Hindus of Muslims — should live in peace and terrorism is completely brought unde control.

As far as the State of Punjab is concerned, this is the opinion of everybody, whether here or outside, that this Government has been able to bring normalcy in that State. We have successfully conducted elections in Punjab and a popular government has been installed there. After the political process was started, militancy has been contained. We have also held Panchayat elections recently in Punjab and the Congress Party has emerged victorious. It was a mini referendum. People of Punjab have shown once again their faith in the Congress Party. More than 95 lakh people exercised their franchise in Punjab. Developmental activities are taking place there and we are quite hopeful that militancy would be completely removed.

There was a feeling among the people in the North-Eastern region that they were not being taken care of by the Government. Now, in Assam, ULFA activities have been contained. Elections were held and popular government was installed there. Congress Party has

come to power there. To add to the achievements of this Government, settlement with Bodos has been arrived it. It goes to the credit of this Government that autonomous status has been given to the Bodo area. Militancy has been contained there. To prove that the people in the North-East are with the Congress Party and Congress Government, we have won elections in Meghalaya and Nagaland. The people have given their massive mandate in favour of the Congress Party. So, in the North-Eastern region, we have established our supremacy and elected governments have been installed.

I now refer to the economic policies. When the new economic policy was brought in, all the leaders and also the various political parties had their reservations but now that our new economic p[illegible] started yielding results, they are appreciating the stand of the Government. Whether it is in the field of agriculture or in the field of industry or trade and technology, this Government has proved that the new economic policy which was been brought by the hon. Prime Minister was the right policy and it has started yielding good results. Today our foreign exchange reserve is to the extent of five billion dollars whereas during the days of the previous Government, that is prior to June 1991, the foreign exchange reserve was as low as two thousand crores. Even our country's gold was pledged to foreign countries and in the international arena, India's credibility went down in the eyes of international financial institutions. They were not prepared to finance our various projects. We did not even have fourteen days' reserves for the purpose of meeting our debt obligations. But today, the economic situation has improved. The foreign exchange reserves position has also improved. The rate of inflation which was 16.5 per cent has been brought down 6.9 per cent. This is the achivement of the Government. The price level which was increasing last year started declining.

Above all these things has come the Budget. The present Budget which was presented by our hon. Finance Minister has not only been welcomed by the leaders of the Congress Party, but other political leaders, irrespective of their party affiliations, have also welcomed this Budget. They have some reservations here and there, but, broadly, the Budget has been hailed by all the political leaders. Sir, this is a very soft Budget. A lot of concessions have been given to the common man, to the housewives and the downtrodden people. Not only that. There is also no tax burden put on the people of this country.

So far as the developmental activities are concerned, I would like to point out that more foreign investment is coming into the country. The level of foreign investment, so far is 2.3 billion dollars. There was not much foreign investment coming in the earlier period. After this Budget a lot of foreign companies are trying to enter into joint ventures and start various industries in our country. In this connection, I would like to point out about the case of China. It was called an 'iron curtain' country. Foreign investment was not allowed there earlier. But now, in China, NRI investment alone is 16 billion dollars a year.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala): NRC investment, not NRI.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Yes. NRC investment, non-resident Chinese investment. The growth rate in China is about 17.5 per cent. Sir if even China, which was a closed country earlier, has gone in for market economy, if we, in India, lag behind and do not take into account the changes that are taking place on the world economic scene, we will not be able to go fofward, we will not be able to develop further.

In agriculture, as I said, we have achieved a growth rate of 4.5 per cent.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Because of the Monsoon.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The foodgrains production which was 166 million tonnes has now gone up to 177 million tonnes. In industry also, the

[Shri V. Narayanasamy]

growth rate is 4.3 per cent. There are the achievements of this Government so far as the economic front is concerned.

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): Mr. Narayanasamy, will you please yield for a minute? It is a very interesting initiation of the discussion. The hon. Member has referred to China's economic shift. But I would like to point out. It is true, as the hon. Member has rightly pointed out. They call it 'socialist market economy' and we have to study that. But whatever they are doing, they are doing on a sound foundation which they have built. They achieved independence two years after we achieved indepenednce. But they have progressed in all fields. They have progressed in the field of sports, in the field of culture, everywhere (*Interruptions*). The hon. Member's machanically drawing a parallel between China and India is not going to help us.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Narayanasamy, please go on.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh): Sir just one minute. What Mr. Narayanasmy was trying to say was this. I myself had been to China. Recently, I had been there with a parliamentary delegation. The case Mr. Narayanasamy was trying to make out was, earlier, China had closed its doors for foreign investment. Now, in order to improve their economy, they have invited foreign investors. They have opened the doors to foreign investment. He is not comparing India wth China. He is only comparing the viewpoints. China is now allowing foreign investment. It was totally closed earlier. They have now opened the doors. This was the point being made by him. He was not comparing India with China. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Balaram, you can refute it when you get your chance. Now. Mr. Narayanasamy, you please carry on.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: We never had banned foreign investment here.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: China itself has opened the doors.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: We do not agree wth you. You carry on.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I did not expect that you would agree with me.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Let us talk about our country. We never banned foreign investment to come.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Now, coming to the Mandal Commission, it was a subject matter of controversy in 1991. The V. P. Singh Government was claiming that they are the champions of the backward classes and to counter the BJPs propaganda on the Mandir issue Shri V. P. Singh...

SHRI ARANGIL SREEDHARAN (Kerala): It was the outcome of the Mandal Commission's recommendations. Do not attribute political motives.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You can reply when your turn comes.

SHRI ARANGIL SREEDHARAN: Mr. Narayanasamy do not come down to such cheap levels.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I am stating my viewpoint. The notification which was brought by the V. P. Singh Government in September 1991 was partial. It said that 27 per cent reservations were applicable to the backward classes as far as the Central Government jobs were concerned. After that, the Congress Government and the Congress manifesto made it very clear that the creamy layer among the backward classes should not be allowed to get the benefits. We were very firm in our opinion. This was stated in categorical terms by our Prime Minister, Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Even when he was the Leader of the Opposition, he had stated very categorically that the people among the forward communities, if they are below

the capacity for the purpose of getting any benefit, should also be considered for reservation. This was not accepted by the V. P. Singh Government and the matter went to the Supreme Court.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: Did you have this in your manifesto? It was in the manifesto of the BJP.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Gautam, I will not permit like this. You have to seek the permission of the Chair first. In this way I cannot run the House.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: For the purpose of the hon. Members I will read two paragraphs from page 32 of the Congress Party manifesto.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Which year's manifesto?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: 1991 manifesto. On page 32 it has been very clearly mentioned, I quote:

> "In implementing these special measures, preference will be given to the poorer sections among the backward classes, while ensuring that, if candidates are not available from the poorer sections, the benefit will go to other members within the backward classes."

Then it says:

> "The Congress will bring forward necessary legislation to establish a Backward Classes Development Corporation.
>
> The Congress is also committed to ensuring that the benefits of reservation are provided to other economically backward sections of our people who are not covered by the existing schemes."

These are the two points. The poorest in the backward classes and the poorer section in the forward classes will be considered for reservation. That was in the Congress manifesto and the same thing has been accepted by the Supreme court. Now after the Supreme Court judgement has come, Shri V. P. Singh started saying that his stand has been vindicated by the Supreme Court. I differ from him on this point. It is the Congress Party's stand which has been vindicated. It is the stand of our former Prime Minister Shri Rajiv Gandhi and also our present Prime Minister which has been vindicated by the Supreme Court on the question of promotion, on the question of reservation, on the question of creamy layer or on the question of 10 per cent reservation for the other communities.

Sir, I would like to state that in some of the States the reservation quota exceeds more than 50 per cent. In Tamil Nadu it is more than 67 per cent. But now the Supreme Court judgement says that it should not exceed 50 per cent. That is the dictum of the Supreme court which all the State Governments have to follow. When the reservations were announced by Shri V. P. Singh, he was taking pride. Even today he claims that he is the champion of the backward classes. Sir, it is not correct. Now, the Supreme Court judgement has even hurt the feelings of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Supreme Court judgment says that not only the backward classes but to other people also, for purposes of promotion, the reservation clause is not applicable. Now the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes also are affected by the Supreme Court judgment.

Who went to the Supreme Court for the implementation of the Mandal Commission's recommendations? It was the Janata Dal. And today when they say that their stand has been vindicated, the House has to understand whether it is a fact or not. All the six points that I have mentioned indicate that it is only the benefits which has to accrue to the backward classes that have been crippled by the Supreme ourt at the instance of the Janata Dal.

SHRI S. MADHAVAN (Tamil Nadu): What are you going to do?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We have only to implement the Supreme Court judgment—we have no other go. ...(*Interruptions*)...

[Shri V. Narayanasamy]

Now, the Supreme Court has said it in very clear terms that within four months the backward classes have to be identified and now, therefore, the Government has come out with a legislation for the implementation of the Supreme Court judgement. Therefore, even the Congress Party has been taking the stand that the backward classes have to be helped and taken care of.

THE MINISTER OF POWER (SHRI N. K. P. SALVE): You should understand properly.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: I am understanding properly.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: As far as the exit policy is concerned, the communist leaders have been opposing it tooth and nail. They have forgotten that in the year 1983 when more than 36 textile mills were closed in Ahmedabad and Bombay, thousands of workers were subjected to a lot of suffering. It was Shrimati Indira Gandhi, the then Prime Minister, who ordered the opening of 13 mills. In her wisdom she had agreed to opening of the mills, and it was with very great difficuly that those sick mills were reopened.

Sir, there are more than 22 lakh small and medium units in this country which were closed down due to sickness and their workers rendered jobless. But the Left ledaers have been going about telling people in this country that even if a unit becomes sick, its workers have got to be given all the benefits. Now, I do subscribe to the theory of protecting the interests of the labour: I am not against it. But when I say that a sick unit has to be closed down, then what will happen to the labour employed therein? They have to be taken care of and they should be given all the due benefits. Those employees who are above 50 years of age should be given some benefits for taking care of their families. Then there are employees in the age group of 35 to 49, and they should be given some training for the purpose of redeployment in other units. And employees below 35 years of age should also be given some training and employed in other places. But I think the Left leaders would be happy to see a unit going sick and dying, without providing for any assistance or help to it.

Sir, I would like to submit that more than 22,000 textile mill employees are suffering—which is a known fact—which the Left leaders also know very well. But they want to play politics there with the labour, and that is the sorry state of affairs. Therefore, the Government has brought forth an innovative scheme known as the National Renewal Fund. Initially it was not accepted by them but now, through negotiations, they are coming closer to the Government for the implementation of this National Renewal Fund scheme. Under this programme the Government has provided for three major schemes. Firstly, for creating employment opportunities, funds are provided. If a sick mill is closed down, funds are provided for giving the "Golden Handshake" to the labour—to settle their accounts and go. Then thre is the Employees Provident Fund Scheme, which is based on contributions by the employee and the employer, and with that fund the employee will be able to get some benefit if a unit is closed down.

Sir, here I would like to add one more thing. If the employees of a sick unit themselves come forward, whenever an industrial unit becomes sick, and want to run the unit on a cooperative basis—it is successful in some areas and I am very happy about it—then I would request the hon. Prime Minister to consider such proposals and, if it happens to be a public sector undertaking, then the workers should be allowed by the Government to do so. It is necessary because the employees of such units should be ensured job security. The employees should also be given the benefit of training for redeployment in other industries. This should also be accepted as far as the trade unions are concerned. But when the country is going in for fast development the Left leaders should not

take a rigid stand and should not feel that labour interest alone is of paramount consideration. There are various other considerations. Technical developments are taking place. Modernisation is is taking place. The country should also keep pace with the developments in the world for the purpose of its development. Therefore, I urge upon the leaders to co-operate with the Government for the purpose of implementation of the exit policy. As promised, the Government has announced Rs. 2,000 crores. The funds...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: For the exit of the Government.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Your Government's exit was within seven months. Don't talk our Government. You have no moral right to talk about our Government.

Therefore, the exit policy, the leaders have to accept. It is a noval scheme under which the employees will get benefit. It is not against the interests of the employees. This, they have to understand.

Sir, one or two points I will make about our schemes for the purpose of lifting of the poor and the down-trodden.

Sir, in the Eighth Five-year Plan...

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Your arguments do not carry any conviction at all. You can go ahead.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Because of the way in which your minds are closed, you cannot receive whatever I say as far as the labour problems are concerned.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: We are trying to receive it, but it is going over our heads. We are not able to receive it.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It always goes over your head. That I knwo. ...(*Interruptions*). Always you will try to receive my point, but then it will go over your head because you have certain commitments. I cannot help it.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: We are not non-commital people. We have got commitments.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: The exit policy has not even been mentioned by the President. Even the Government has given it up....(*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): I think, at least, you will understand the labour problem.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: He is talking about the exist policy, not the labour problem....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Let him finish.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, the Government's concern for rural employment and creation of more employment in the rural areas can be very well seen by the allocation of Rs. 30,000 crores. Compared to Rs. 16,000 crores in the Seventh Plan, in the Eighth Plan Rs. 30,000 crores have been allocated for the purpose of giving employment to the rural people under the Rozgar Yojana Scheme and all other schemes.

As far as the States are concerned, the Central Government is receiving a lot of complaints. The funds provided to the States for the purpose of rural employment, have not been utilised properly. Not only that, but those funds have been diverted for other schemes. This is not a matter which has to be taken in a light vein.

The Rural Employment Guarantee Programme was brought by Smt. Indira Gandhi, our former Prime Minister, and also Shri Rajiv Gandhi and the present Prime Minister for the purpose of fulfilling the wishes of the previous leaders. Not only that, but to give the employment guarantee for the poorer sections, more funds have been provided.

Sir, now I urge upon the Rural Development Ministry to see that the funds which have been provided should reach the people, the poor people, the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes people and the people who are below the poverty-line. The benefit should reach them. Actually, the people below the poverty-line are 37 per cent. They

[Shri V. Abrayanasamy]

should be brought above the poverty-line. That is the aim and object of the Government. All the State Governments have to co-operate with the Government for the purpose of employment programmes.

Sir, various social welfare measures have been brought. I would like to submit that schemes have been brought for the benefit of women. The Backward Classes Commission and the Scheduled Castes Development Corporation—all these schemes have been brought for the purpose of development of the community. In the President's Address the social welfare schemes and the rural-employment programmes and the Government's mind for the purpose of developing the rural people, especially those from the agricultural sector, have been well depicted.

From last year in our country we find that a number of foreign leaders are coming. Especially, India's foreign policy has remained unchanged in spite of various pressures from various super powers. Recently, apart from 4.00 P.M. he SAARC countries leaders visiting India, the British Prime Minister came. He was our guest of honour during the Republic Day parade. Three important issues were raised. They all related to NPT, Jammu and Kashmir and Amnesty International. India's position was very firm. During the discussion with the British Prime Minister, our hon. Prime Minister made it very clear that India's position on all these three issues remains unchanged. It is a welcome thing that the British Prime Minister went with the impression that India has got a solid foreign policy on various international issues. We also had the visit of the Russian President in our country. He, in categorical terms, had stated that Pakistan should not interfere in the internal affairs of India. Various agreements were signed during his visit. The visits of the British Prime Minister, Russan President and that of the German Chancellor, Helmut Kohl, are historical visits. Never in the history of our country within a period of two months top ledaers of the world came to India and signed various agreements for the purpose of development, trade and commerce and science and technology. All these things have been widely acclaimed by various political parties.

To my surprise I find that the developments are taking place and our country's relations with other countries are improving, but they are not being appreciated by various political leaders. The months of January and February can be described as golden period for India, because leaders from various countries have visited India and have said that India, which is a developing country, has got potential for development; they are prepared to bring in a lot of investment for setting up industries in this country and for having joint ventures with India. India is now being looked upon as a potential country by various foreign powers not only for improving relations, but also for developing industrial base and also for having joint ventures. That is because India's relations with other countries have remained unchanged. In fact, Indian foreign policy is a matter of pride for all of us.

Sir, I would like to submit one point relating to Panchayati Raj institutions. Legislations to that effect were passed in this august House and also in the Lok Sabha with the cooperation of the leaders in the firm of Constitution 72nd and 73rd Amendments. If was the decision of our great leaders, late Shri Rajiv Gandhi, that the Panchayati Raj institutions have to be established throughout the country and that the power should go to the people at the grassroot level and the elected representatives. So, a constitutional status had to be given to the Panchayati Raj institutions. I thank the hon. Members of this House that they cooperated for passing these two Bills. As a result, all the State Governments are going to have a three-tier system for the purpose of having Panchayati Raj institutions in this country. Credit for passing these Constitutional (Amendment) Bills goes to Prime Minister Narasimha Rao. Achievemnts of this Government have been highlighted in the President's Address. The Action that the Govern-

ment proposes to take for the development of the country have also been highlighted briefly. Therefore, I would like to submit that the President's Address gives an account of the Government's achievements during the last year and what the Government is going to do this year has also been highlighted in the President's Address. Hon. President also in his concluding paragraphs has stated that in this country there is a potential for development and we need communal harmony in this country. We hope the development will take place and that peaceful atmosphere will be there in the country. Therefore, he called upon the Parliamentarians to cooperate with the Government for the purpose of developing this nation. Therefore, Sir, I once again thank the honourable President for having addressed both the Houses of Parliament. I also submit that the President's Address gives the details of the achievements of the Government relating to the various States. The Presidents Address also mentions about the various aspects and the proposed Plan of this Government. With these words, I conclude. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now Shri Madan Bhatia to make his speech seconding the Motion.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I rise to second the Motion which is before this honourable House expressing the deep gratitude of the Members of this honourable House to the President for the Address which he was pleased to deliver to both the Houses of Parliament on the 22nd February, 1993.

Sir, the history of Indian National Congress is the history of its fight for India's independence and for those values which have been the soul of India's heritage. It is on the strength of those values, peace, harmony, amity, tolerance, sense of oneness of religions that this ancient civilisation has survived terrible trials and tribulations down the centuries.

The Indian National Congress had put up a relentless fight against those political forces which stirred up communal passion in this country to bring about partition of India. But it is to the credit of the Congress that despite a division of India which was thrust upon this ancient land in the name of religion, we did not give up our commitment to those values which we had cherished. It is because of the commitment of the Congress to those values and ideals of the ancient civilisation of India that independent India was born as a secular State, a home for all, irrespective of their religion, who chose to stay in India.

The Constitution of India which was adopted by the Constituent Assembly was not merely a statutory framework for the Republic of India, it enshrines a solemn pledge of the people of India that there shall be equality of all citizens irrespective of their caste, creed and religion, that the affairs of the Indian State shall not be governed by the dictates of any religion, that there shall be equality of all religions. But unfortunately it is religion which again has crept into the politics in this country. The communal forces in this country did not die with the partition of India. They did not make any headway till 1977 when the various political forces joined hands together to defeat the Congress. They invited the fundamentalist Muslim leaders on their political platforms to garner the Muslim votes. They went even to the extent of integrating themselves with the Jan Sangh which till then had been the political leper of India. By doing so they lent respectability and legitimacy to communalism in this country. And, India's descension to communal politics and communalisation of the Indian body politic began. In 1979, the Janata Party broke up. The Jan Sangh put on the garbs of the BJP. But anti-Congressism continued to remain the driving force of all the political parties in the Opposition. And, what was the result? The result was that the BJP came to occupy the centre-stage in the Indian politics. The politcs of conclaves in the early 80s was the politics in which the biggest limelight was stolen

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

by the BJP. That was the state of affairs. But the nadir of Indian politics was reached in 1989 when the Janata Dal was installed in power with the help of the leftists on the one side and the BJP on the other. The biggest communal force in this country and the so-called biggest secular party in the Opposition in this country joined hands together and found themselves on the same side of the fence, in order to share the political power with the Janata Dal at the Centre. And, today, we are reaping the bitter fruits of this anti-Congressism. Peace and harmony, which are the basic postulates of any civilised society, have been imperilled. It is fear and hatred which are stalking across the land.

Sir, Ram is not the issue. Islam respects all the religions. Hinduism believes in the essential oneness of all the religions. For some, Rm is God; for some, Ram is 'Purushottam'; for some, Ram is the embodiment of the finest qualities which any human being can ever have. After Tulsidas, the finest and the most sublime description of Ram was given by Mohammed Iqbal in the short poem, titled "Ram", which I would like to share with the hon. Members of this House. How did Mohammed Iqbal describe Ram? He says:

क्लबरेज़ है शराबे हकीकत से जामें-हिन्द
यह हिंदियों के फिक्रे फलक रस का है असर
इस देश में हुए हैं हजारों मलिक सरिश्त
है राम के वजूद पे हिंदोस्तां को नाज़
एजाज़ इस चिरागे हिदायत का यही है

सब फलसफी है खित्ता-ए-मगरिब के राम-ए-हिंद
रिफ अत में आसमां से भी ऊंचा है बामें-हिंद
मशहर जिनके दम से है दुनिया में नामें-हिंद
अहले नज़र समझते हैं इसको इमाम-हिंद
रौशन तराज़ सहर है ज़माने में शामें-हिंद

तलवार का धनी था, शुजाअत में फ़र्द था
पाकीज़गी में, जोशे मुहब्बत में फ़र्द था

We do not have to go to the sketches of Ram in the Constitution of India which was signed in the Constituent Assembly to say that Ram is an integral part of the national heritage. It was Mohammed Iqbal who wrote in the 20s, or in the early 30s, that it was Ram who was part of the national heritage of India. Rama, is therefore, not the issue. The issue is the danger to which India has been subjected by that monstrous force which has hit the world from time to time and which has been unleashed against this country by the BJP. This monstrous force is generated when religion is mixed up with politics. It is this monstrous force which hit Europe with civil war for thirty years in the 17th century; it is this monstrous force which rained death and destruction on a tiny country like Ireland; it is this monstrous force which has brought havoc to a small country like Lebanon; it is this monstrous force which brought about the partition of this ancient civilised country and it is this monstrous force which has retarded and stultified the progress in those countries which have been gripped with fundamentalism. The fight in India today is against this monstrous force, this monstrous force which has been unleashed by the BJP in its naked pursuit of politcal power. I have no doubt in my mind that ultimately, a solution will be found in respect of the Ram Janmabhoomi-Babri Masjid issue. The innate good sense of the Hindus and Muslims in this country is bound to try and the day is bound to come when Ayodhya itself will become an eloquent testimony to the harmony between the Hindus and Muslims, by their mutual accommodation of their respective sentiments and religious faiths. I have no doubt about that. In this regard, the President's Address mentions the reference which has been made to the Supreme Court under article 143 of the Constituion of India. Opposition has been raised by some quarters that this reference under article 143 of the Constitution of India is inadequate. The reference ought to have been made under article 138 of the Constitution of India through transfer of the cases, which are pending in the Allahabad High Court, so that the question of title to this particular piece of land, should also be decided by the Supreme Court. Do we

realise the possible disastrous consequences of the suggestion which is being made? Let us face the reality. Millions of Hindus have come to believe and it has become their strong religious faith that Rama was born at that particular site. Why have they acquired this religious faith? It is because of the massive political propaganda which has been carried out in this country by the BJP over the last few years. This may by the cause but the effect is this Therefore, the question of title to this particular piece of land has become totally irrelevant. Now, what was the propaganda which has been carried out by the BJP for its political ends. That there was an ancient temple of Rama there which was destroyed to build a mosque? It is this propagnda which has led to the creation of a faith among the people. Millions of Hindus have come to believe it. Now, let us presume that the Supreme Court decides, yes, there was an ancient temple which was destroyed and the mosque was built. But at the same time, the Supreme Court says, by the law of prescription or otherwise, the title to the land today belongs to the wakf. Where shall we go from there? To my mind, to blood strewn, strife and anarchey. Religious faith transcends logic. The Sikhs have come to believe that the hand-print of Panja Sahib belongs to Guru Nanak. Now it is their religious faith. The Muslims have come to believe that the hair in the holy mosque, Hazrat Bal at Srinagar, belongs to Prophet Mohammed. The Christians have come to believe that Christ was born at that particular site where ttoday there is a Church outside Jerusalem. If the Supreme Court gives a finding 'yes, there was a temple... (*Interruption*)...

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: And should the Hindus believe that Ram was born at Ayodhya. .(*Interruptions*) ...this is also correct.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: ..... which was destroyed and the mosque was built, no force in this country will be able to *efface the religious faith of the Hindus*, hundreds and millions of Hindus, and it will be impossible for any force to stand in the way of the construction of the temple. Therefore, I submit, Sir, that we must realise, when we say that the question of title should have been referred to the Supreme Court, we are closing our eyes to the reality. But if the Supreme Court says 'there was never any temple there, there was only a mosque', then the entire propaganda which has been carried out by the BJP will stand exposed to the people as totally false as political propaganda and the question of construction of the temple at that particular site shall not arise.

As I have said, the issue of Ayodhya is bound to be settled one day and we are on the right path. I submit that we sholud also remember that the fire of religiosity with which the BJP has inflamed the body-politic in this country cannot be fought with the cold logic of secularism. If we believe that we can fight this monsstrous force of religion mixed up with politics by means of rallies, peace-marches, demonstrations, public meetings appeal to the ancient culture of India, appeal for harmony and peace, we are forgetting the history of India. Even the Indian National Congress led by some of the greatest sons that India has produced like Mahatma Gandhi, Jawaharlal Nehru, Maulana Azad, Patel and others could not withstand the onslaught of religiosity which was unleashed by the Muslim League for political ends to bring about the partition of India. I am, therefore, of the firm belief that the might of the Indian State must stand up and flight against this monstrous force and for that purpose I would like to commend six measures to the Government for its consideration.

Firstly, the Representation of the People Act, I believe, must be amended to provide that if any political party seeks to exploit any religious issue or instigates religious sentiments in a manner, that will tend to enhance its electoral prospects...it will not only be barred from participating in any elections but, if it does so when the process of

election has been initiated, all its candidate will stand disqualified.

Secondly, any individual who exploits or instigates religious sentiments of any community for personal political gains or indulges in any activity which impinges upon the sovereignty of India or instigates any outside force to interfere in the internal affairs of India should be dealt with ruthlessly by the penal and preventive laws of India and, if necessary, laws of India should be amended to inflict exemplary punishment on him.

Thirdly, any elected Member of Parliament or State Legislature who indulges in any activity which is in consistent with the oath which he take before he assumes his seat in the Parliament or the State Legislature to uphold the Constitution of India and its basic features of secularism, sovereignty and integrity of India should be disqualified. There is no mandate in the entire Constitution behind the breach of the solemn oath which every Member has to take before he assumes his seat in the Assembly or in the Parliament. This oath which is taken is an exercise, at the moment, in futility. I, therefore, am recommending to the Government to consider seriously whether the time has not come when this penal mandate must be provided as against the breach of the solemn constitutional oath which a Member is required to tike to uphold the Constitution, to uphold secularism, to uphold the integrity of India.

Fourthly, I believe, the time has come when the administrative and political accountability for communal disturbances must be built into the administrative and political system of India. I strongly believe that. We have crossed the stage when the transfer of one bureaucrat or the other bureaucrat will be enough. The time has come that administrative accountabilitw must stand up; political accountabilty must also stand up.

Fifthly, we have established a Rapid Action Force. It should be renamed as a Rapid National Protection Force with specialised training to deal with communal disturbances and terrorism. It should be permanently stationed at sensitive places which have become prone to communal disturbances. It should should have the authority — this is important—it should have the authority and mechanism to swing into action forthwith on its own without any request from the State Government whenever there is outbreak of any communal disturbances. Argument will be raised that this is an encroachment on the power of the State. The constitutional position today is this that when the breakdown of public order assumes such a proportion that it cannot be dealt with except by the deployment of the armed forces of the Union, then it becomes internal disturbance within the terms of Article 355 of the Constitution and article 355 of the Constitution says that it shall be the duty of the Union to protect every State against external aggression as well as internal disturbance. If there is an external aggression the Union does not seek the permission of the State Government before it sends its army to that State. Similarly, if there is any internal disturbance the Union does not have to seek the permission of the State Government to swing into action because for the protection of the constitutional rights of the citizens the writ of the Union runs-upon every foot of the Indian soil.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Why was it not invoked before 6th of December?

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: No, please.

SHRI CHHOTUBHAI PATEL (Gujarat): You speak when your turn comes.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: He is an advocate. I am not disturbing him.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: I am not answering questions.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Malaviya, he is not yielding. Let him speak.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Sir, no religious educational institution should be allowed to function which inculcates the

poison of communalism in young minds and has turned itself into a breeding ground of communalism. There are some denominational educational institutions against which there is a complaint that they are becoming a breeding ground of communalism. It may be that Article 30 of the Constitution may have to be amended. It will have to be amended. But the time has come because our fight is going to be relentless against the communal forces in this country and the fight has to be relentless on all fronts, the constitutional front, the administrative front, the political front, the economic front. Having said that, I would like to add, communalism is communalism, whether it is Hindu communalism or Muslim Communalism. The time has come for large sections of some misguided Muslim citizens of this country to emerge from under the shadow of the leadership of the pulpit and the political leadership of those who speak the same language, utter the same idiom, play upon the same passions, arouse the same sentiments which the Muslim League, before the partition, used to do, except that they do not talk of partition. Sir, there are some hotheads who have spoken in the language of revolt. Revolt against whom? Revolt against India? Do the citizens of a country revolt against their own country? The future of every citizen, the future of the Muslim citizens lies in the mainstream of national life. And those leaders for their political ends who play upon the separatist sentiments of the Muslim community or some other community, are doing the greatest grievous harm to their own community. The protection of every citizen in this country lies in the Constitution of India, the might of the Indian State, the strength and the force of the secular forces in this country. One does not have to go to any other quarter or any other source for protection of the constiutional rights of any citizens, whether he is a Hindu or he is a Muslim or he is a sikh or he is a Christian. All said and done, Sir. I also believe that the ultimate battle of communalism will have to be won on the fields of education and economics. So long as there is poverty, so long as there is illiteracy, so long as there is unemployment there will always be forces around to exploit the parochial sentiments of sections of the people for their narrow political ends. Massive investment in education, strong and stringent measures to control the growth of population and the rapid industrialisation of this country to provide fresh avenues of employment to the rising new generations will be the ultimate answer and the ultimate triumph of secularism in this country. That is my prayer, that is my wish and that is my vision. Sir, this Government led by Shri P. V. Narasimha Raoji, is accused by certain quarters of indecisive leadership. This reminds me of the speech of Antony in Shakespeare's play 'Julius Caesar'. Brutus had murdered Caesar and had accused him of ambition. And Antony replies to the crowd——whose feelings had been whipped up by Brutus, who said that Caesar was ambitious and, therefore, he had killed him——Antony says something like this, "Thrice I offered the Crown to him and thrice he refused and yet Brutus says, Caesar was ambitious; and Caesar is an honourable man." I feel like answering this charge which is being made against this Government and against the hon. Prime Minister somewhat in the same way. Take Punjab. The democratic process was initiated. A duly elected Government was installed. Panchayat elections have taken place. Municipal elections have taken place. After a decade of turbulent terrorism in Punjab, the people of Punjab have started heaving a sigh of relief and freedom. Is this the achievement——I would ask — of an indecisive Government? Take economics. The rate of inflation which had gone beyond 16 per cent, near about 17 per cent, has come down to 6.9 per cent. The Government was almost pulled back from the precipice of bankruptcy when it was left with only 1 billion dollars in 1991 and today, it has a comfortable reserve of foreign exchange to the tune of 5 billion dollars. The industry has started picking up. So far as agriculture is concerned, its production is going to reach, this year, as optimum level of 176 to

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

177 million tonnes. The export has started picking up. So far as the rate of inflation in the foodgrains is concerned, the rate has come down from more than 24 per cent to 3 per cent. Are these the achievements of a Government which is indecisive? I know Mr. Manmohan Singh. I know him since the college days. We were together at Cambridge. I still remember the day when I went to see my own result on the Cambridge University Board. I was reading English and he was reading Economics. Simultaneously, the result of Economics had also been put up. I saw my result. I saw his result. On his name, there was a star which means that he not only got first but he got star first. Sir, if you ask me what the greatest achievement in the field of economics today is, I would say that the inspiring leadership of Mr. Narasimha Rao with a future vision on the Indian economic direction has combined with the academic brilliance of Mr. Manmohan Singh to give a new direction to the industrial and economic policies of this country. The Government is accused of having departed from the Nehruvian economic and industrial policy. There cannot be a greater travesty of truth than this. I would like to place before this hon. House as to what Nehru said about the foreign capital and the nature of industrialism in the world today. I will just read out. But before I do that, I would like to pose six questions and answer them and then I will come to this.

The first question that I will pose is, does the Indian State have sufficient funds to expand the public sector? The answer obviously is 'no', Does the Indian State have sufficient funds to continue to sustain losses on those sick units whose exclusive control of the State is not essential for the public good? In this regard, I may mention that there are 81 sick units which were taken over. They are suffering an annual loss of Rs. 140 crores. Total allocation before this Budget to education in the country was about Rs. 1300 crores. This shows the total perversity of approach towards the social and economic problems of this country. On the one hand, the public exchequer is suffering a loss of Rs. 1400 crores and the sick units refuse to go above the ground and on the other hand, we do not have sufficient funds to invest in education which, in fact, would ultimately decide along with economics the fate of the Indian secular State.

Thirdly, has the private enterprise not accumulated greater enterprise and capital? The answer is 'yes' and that is why there has to be liberalisation. Along with this, I pose another question. Has the bureaucratisation not retarded the growth of the industry in this country? The answer is 'yes'. Can we say the answer is not 'yes'? Then, Sir, has India not lagged behind the advanced nations of the world in the progress of industrialisation and technology? Can the answer be otherwise than 'yes'? Does in the present state of economy Indian capital need to be supplemented by foreign capital or not? The answer obviously has to be 'yes'. These are the answers. Against the background of these answers, let me place before this hon. House what Shri Jawaharlal Nehru said about foreign capital. He was speaking in 1948 and he said:

> "The stress on the need to regulate in the national interest the scope and manner of foreign capital arose from past association of foreign capital and control in the foreign domination of the economy of the country."

That was our legacy and that was the legacy which we have to take care of. But the circumstances today are quite different and that is the note which Mr. Nehru strikes. I further quote:

> "The object of our regulation should therefore, be the utilisation of foreign capital in a manner most advantageous to the country. Indian capital needs to be supplemented by foreign capital not only because the national savings will not be enough for the rapid development of the country on the scale visualised but

also because in many cases scientific, technical and industrial knowledge and capital equipment can best be secured along with foreign capital."

This is what Mr. Nehru said in 1948 and we have travelled a long way, away from the legacy which made stringent regulation of the incursion of foreign capital into India necessary. Then, what did he say about the nature of industrialism in the world? He said:

"What perhaps is not sufficiently realised is the international character of industrialisation. It has broken down national boundaries and has made nations dependent on others.....It has broken down national boundaries and has made nations dependent on others. The idea of nationalism is almost as strong as it was before and in its name only wars are still fought and millions are slaughered. But it is a myth which is not in keeping with the reality. The world has become internationalised. Production is internationalised; markets are international; and transport is international. Only men's ideas continue to be governed by a dogma which has no relation to the realities."

The idea of industrial sovereignty of any nation today, in the present-day world, is nothing but a myth. But then this Government is accused of bartering away the economic sovereignty of India. Economic sovereignty in the present day interdependent world is the privilege of a stagnant and retarded nation. Even the most industrialised countries of Europe have been compelled to come together by shedding not only their economic, but also their political, sovereignty in order to keep pace with the challenges of competition which have been thrown up by countries like the United States and Japan. This is the state of affairs of most of the industrialised countries of Europe which are wanting to get out of the inertia and that is why they concluded the Treaty of Milan in 1978. If this is the state of affairs of the industrialised countries of Europe, how can we say that India, by interlinking herself with the global market and global economy, is bartering away the economic sovereignty of herself? This charge is nothing but a stick to beat the Government with and I am happy that the Government has stuck to these policies under the leadership of Shri P. V. Narasimha Rao and has left no doubts in the minds of the people of this country and the people in the world at large that India will continue to tread this path till the realization of the dream which has been cherished and envisioned: an industrialised, vibrant and vigorous economy of India.

Sir, let us take the question of our foreign policy. We have given a new thrust to the Sino-Indian relations. The process started during the days of Rajiv-ji and a new thrust has been given now. We have built new bridges to strengthen our relations with the United States. And, any person who thinks that any country today can boast of a good foreign policy, when it is at loggerheads with the United States, is living under an illusion. We have enlightened and convinced the entire world about our stand on Kashmir and about the nefarious activities of Pakistan in supporting terrorism in India. Is that a meek achievement?

Sir, we have defeated the designs of Pakistan to create a solid bloc of fundamentalist Muslim countries on the frontiers of India under the leadership of Pakistan. Are these the achievements of an indecisive Government?

So far as Russia is concerned, our relations with Russia have emerged from under the shadow of the changes that have taken place in the erstwhile Soviet Union and we have put those relations back on the traditional base of abiding friendship. These are our achievements in the field of foreign policy. Are these the achievements of an indecisive leadership? Then, Sir, what is our Defence? India's Defence is progressing rapidly towards self-reliance. And India's defence preparedness has defeated all the designs of Pakistan to seize Kashmir by force. Is this the achievement of an indecisive

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

Government? Sir, after the perfidy—that was the expression used by Shri P. V. Narasimha Roaji, the Prime Minister — after the perfidy which the country faced at Ayodhya, once again the might of the Indian State has stood up and has picked up the gauntlet which was thrown before the Indian State by these communal forces of this country. And that cannot be said to be the action or the exercise of a Government which is weak and which is indecisive.

Sir, more than 40 years ago, we had included article 40 in the Constitution of India in the Directive Principles that India shall be given the Panchayati Raj, and the people shall be given the right to determine their own destinies at the grassroots level. This dream, this vision was first envisioned by Rajivji. But it is this Government which provided the practical mantle to that vision in the last session. The Constitution was amended and the Panchayati Raj has now become a constitutional reality. And what is Panchayati Raj? It is the right which has been given to the people of India to determine their social and economic destiny at the grassroots level. Is this the achievement of a Government which is indecisive, which is week? These are my answers.

Lastly, Sir, India lives in the villages. And the backbone of India is the farmer. We have increased the support prices of the various foodgrains and the agricultural produce, giving tremendous support to the farmer. We have provided Rs. 350 crores to cushion the increase in the prices of fertilizers. And then this Government has provided Rs. 500 crores to develop agricultural infrastructure for small and marginal farmers. This is the concern of this Government for the farmers. Is this the concern of a Government which is indifferent to the fate of the millions of farmers in this country? And above all, Sir, as I say, India lives in the villages, and the outlay for rural development has been increased from Rs. 6,000 crores and odd to Rs. 30,000 crores in the Eighth Plan. This is the concern of this Government for the villages of India, the heart-beat of India. And yet this Government is accused, the Prime Minister is accused of being indecisive. This is the extent to which the press in this country is taking up this particular issue and repeating it *ad nauseam*. The Public Distribution System has been revamped for tribal, drought prone and desert and hilly areas. Sir I need not dilate further but this is my answer to the accusation which is made against the Government, against the leadership of the Prime Minister and against the Prime Minister himself.

Having said that, at the close, I will say that at page 8 of the Address it has been said, "However, the present growth of 1.95 per cent is still very high and stabilisation of the population will, therefore, be an overriding national priority." Sir, our cities are decaying; our villages have become stagnant. All the infrastructures providing social services like health, education and other things are being overwhelmed. Unemployment is increasing. The total number of the poor people is increasing. The forests are being decimated. Wild life is disappearing and social tensions within the body politic are building up. Why has this happened? It is because the population of this country has increased despite tremendous economic, industrial and agricultural growth from 32 crores in 1951 to 86 crores in 1991. Unless we are in a position to control this population, whatever progress we make in whatever field, we shall not be able to succeed, and that has to be the first priority so far as this nation is concerned, and that is why this Address says: "Popuation will be an overriding national priority. And I believe and I have faith that as the Congress has given lead to this country at different times in the history in different fields and for different causes, it will be the Congress Party under the leadership of the Government, under the leadership of Shri P.V. Narasimha Rao that this challenge which has been thrown up by rapid increase in population, will be taken up and ultimately this battle will be won. Sir, Napolean addressed his armies in

Egypt under the shadow of the pyramids in these words; "Soldiers, sixty centuries of Egyptian history are looking upon you to see your performance in the battle field." Similarly, one hundred years of the history of Indian National Congress, hundreds of millions of people of this country and the world in its entirety are looking upon the leadership of the Prime Minister, Shri P. V. Narasimha Rao to give a new direction and to grapple with the challenges which have been thrown to the body politic of India and I have my faith, my conviction and my belief that his leadership shall not fail. Thank You.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now, there are 293 amendments to the motion which may have to be moved at this stage.

Amendment Nos. 1 and 2 are by Shri Sangh Priya Gautam.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूं कि :

1. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में 23 दिसम्बर 1992 को राज्य सभा में कल्याण मंत्री द्वारा दिए गए आश्वासन के अनुसार सरकारी संगठनों, मान्यता प्राप्त और सहायता प्राप्त संगठनों में सभी श्रेणियों के पदों में नियुक्तियों एवं पदोन्नतियों में अनुसूचित जाति/अनुसूचित जनजाति के उम्मीदवारों के आरक्षण के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

2. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में 23 दिसम्बर, 1992 को राज्य सभा में कल्याण मंत्री द्वारा दिए गए आश्वासन के अनुसार देश की शैक्षणिक, तकनीकी और चिकित्सा संस्थाओं में अनुसूचित जाति/अनुसूचित जनजाति के विद्यार्थियों के प्रवेश के आरक्षण को जारी रखे जाने का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendments Nos. 3 to 10 are by Shri J. P. Mathur, Shri Viren J. Shah, Shri Krishan Lal Sharma and Shri Sunder Singh Bhandari.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूं कि :

3. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बोट क्लब, नई दिल्ली पर जनता रैलियों पर तीन महीने के लिए लगाये गए प्रतिबंध, जोकि संविधान की धारा 19 का उल्लंघन करता है जिसमें भाषण की स्वतन्त्रता और शान्तिपूर्ण तथा बिना हथियार सभा करने की स्वतंत्रता की गारन्टी दी गई है, के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

4. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश के बहुत बड़ भाग, अर्थात् जम्मू और कश्मीर, हिमाचल प्रदेश, राजस्थान, उत्तर प्रदेश और मध्य प्रदेश जोकि राष्ट्रपति शासन के अधीन है, में व्याप्त शोचनीय स्थिति और उन राज्यों तथा दिल्ली में अतिशीघ्र निर्वाचित सरकारें उपलब्ध कराने हेतु पक्के वायदे का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

5. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में अनेकों उद्योगों के बंद होने, अधिशेष श्रमिकों की छंटनी और व्यापार तथा उद्योग में रोजगार अवसरों के अभाव के कारण निरन्तर बढ़ रही बेरोजगारी की समस्या का समाधान करने के लिए कोई समय सीमा निर्दिष्ट नहीं की गई है।"

6. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में निर्वाचनों में धन शक्ति, बाहु-बल, डराने-धमकाने एवं अन्य कदाचारों को रोकने के लिए निर्वाचन संबंधी सुधारों के बारे में किसी समयबद्ध कार्यक्रम का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

[श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर]

7. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात्:—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में सरकार द्वारा बंगलादेशी घुसपैठियों का पता लगाने तथा उन्हें निर्वासित करने और उनकी भावी घुसपैठ को पूरी तरह रोकने में नाकामयाब रहने का कोई, उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

8. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात्:—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में पाकिस्तान, बंगलादेश और अन्य देशों में मन्दिरों के बड़ी संख्या में गिराये जाने और उनके नये सिरे से बनाये जाने हेतु एक समयबद्ध कार्यक्रम के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

9. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात्:—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में गरीब किसानों की समास्याओं को दूर करने के लिए किसी समयबद्ध भूमि सुधार कार्यक्रम के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

10. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात् :—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में असंगठित क्षेत्र के श्रमिकों के लिए राहत योजना हेतु किसी समय सारणी का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

11. प्रस्ताव के अन्त में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाये, अर्थात्:—

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में महाराष्ट्र, गुजरात आदि राज्यों में कानून और व्यवस्था को बनाए रखने में सरकार की असफलता का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

5.00 P.M.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 12 to 24, by Dr. Jinendra Kumar Jain. He is not here. Amendment Nos. 25 to 36, by Shri Viren J. Shah. He is also not here.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Sir, I beg to move.

37. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the intention of Government to make comprehensive amendments in the Election Laws."

38. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added, namely*:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the elimination of backwardness in Uttar Pradesh."

39. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the efforts to remove the discontent among the people of Uttarakhand due to poverty and backwardness in that area."

40. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps proposed to be taken by Government to remove the discontent among farmers and to provide them remunerative prices for their produce."

40. That at the end of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to improve the condition of tribals belonging to Mirzapur and Neza-Bara Tehsils, in Allahabad (Uttar Pradesh)."

42 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to eradicate

unemploymnet among educated and uneducated youth in the country."

43. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about the solution of the housing problem and for providing housing units to the homeless persons."

44. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about bringing improvement in the condition of backward areas in the country."

45. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any steps to control the prices of essential commodities and to check steep increase in the cost in living."

46. That at the *end* of the Motiin, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regert that the Address does not mention about any concrete steps to be taken by the Government to check barbarious atrocities on the persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and weaker sections."

47. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to saop the practice of carrying night-soil on the head."

48. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about providing of uninterrupted supply of power to farmers."

49. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about bringing improvement in the functioning of the Nationalised Banks."

50. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention, about taking strict measures to contain the aduleration of foodgrains."

51. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any programme to implement the Assam-Accord."

52. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about taking any concrete steps to contain the communal trends and tension."

53. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the incorporation of the Right to Work in the Constitution as a fundamental right."

54. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about giving unemployment allowance to unemployed persons."

55. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the land reforms."

56. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to improve the living standard of agricultural labourers and landless people."

57. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to check the misuse of Doordarshan and Akash-

[Shri Satya Prakash Malaviya]

wani by the ruling party to achieve its ends."

58. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time-bound programme to improve the conditions of people living below poverty line."

59. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any effective and time-bound scheme to prevent the damages caused every year due to floods, excessive rains and drought."

60. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any effective and time-bound scheme to solve the Punjab problem by eliminating terrorism and restoring peace in that State."

60. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps likely to be taken for the improvement and modernisation of Ramrouli Airport in Allahabad district of Uttar Pradesh."

62. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken by Government to end the crisis prevailing in the areas affected by the acute shortage drinking water."

63. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to check the migration of the rural population to the urban areas in search of jobs."

64. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken to prevent the unrestricted growth of slums in the urban areas."

65. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to stop the exhibition of obscene, vulgar and erotic posters in public places."

66. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to stop the use of English Language which is a symbol of slavery and is a foreign Language, in the official work in the country."

67. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address neither mentions about the measures to retrieve the Indian Territory which is in the unathorised occupation of China nor the measures to be taken to implement the Resolution adopted by the Parliament in 1962 in this regard."

68. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time-bound scheme for eradication of the dowry system."

69. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme for revival of the Sick-Industries."

70. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme for improvement of the plight of the Central Government pensioners."

71. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to give adequate compensation to the farmers for their acquired land."

72. That at the *end* of the Motion ,the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the resentment arising out of the matters involved in the process of appointment of Governors of the States."

73. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to check the extravagance of Government."

74. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *edded*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme for providing prompt justice at cheaper cost to the common man."

75. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to fix maximum limit of the income and expenditure."

76. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of Government to eradicate corruption at the higher levels as well as its lack of willpower for eradicating the same."

77. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the continuously increasing the liabilities of the Government with regard to repayment of external debt."

78. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of Government to unearth the black money and the amount deposited in foreign banks by the Indians and to punish the guilty persons therefor."

79. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the demand to accord the status of Industry to Agriculture."

80. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any positive steps to be taken in respect of inflation, unemployment and agriculture except some platitudes here and there."

81. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps to be taken to check the activities of communal and chauvinistic forces which are posing threat to the spirit of secularism."

82. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the decisive steps to be taken for solving the Punjab and Kashmir problems."

83. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any assurance that Government would not misuse the provisions of Article 356 of the Constitution, as is being done in our country for the last so many years."

84. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps to be taken by Government to contain the rising prices of essential commodities."

85. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any specific time limit for finding a solution to the Ram Janambhoomi-Babri Masjid dispute."

[Shri Satya Prakash Malaviya]

86. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any effective steps to be taken to bring down the prices specially of consumer goods to provide succour to the common man."

87. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time schedule for supplementing the recommendations of the Mandal Commission."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 88 to 99, by Shri Ram Jethmalani. He is not here.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Sir, I move:

100. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any programme to revitalise the Public Sector where the largest capital is invested."

101. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time-bound programme to reduce the heavy foreign debt of India."

102. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any programme to check corruption which is eating into the vitals of our national life despite Security Scam involving thousands of crores of rupees."

103. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any step for checking tax evasion and generation of black money which is the root cause of continuous rise in budgetary deficit."

104. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for enacting law to separate politics from religion and to have effective law to check use of communalism in elections or otherwise."

105. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any effective measures to help the drought-affected Bihar."

106. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about creation of Jharkhand State."

107. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about restructuring the Centre-State relations particularly the financial aspect in the absence of which some poor States are unable to meet even the day to day expenditure."

108. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about continuous neglect of Khadi and Gramodyog, favourite to Gandhiji, and on which several lakhs of families depend."

109. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about U.S. panel action against ISRO and levying of heavy taxes on export of Indian medicines to USA."

110. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address of the fact that demolition of Babri Masjid and subsequent events have lowered the prestige of India as well as Hindus abroad."

111. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time-bound programme for building Sulabh Sauchalaya for women in the villages."

112. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any domestic fuel policy for rural areas in the absence of which green trees are being recklessly destroyed causing heavy environmental problem."

113. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about communalisation of the history and other text-books."

114. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any special programme for the development of poverty zone consisting of Bihar, Orissa and Eastern U.P. etc."

115. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the strong movement in many parts of the country like Andhra Pradesh and Haryana particularly by women for fulfilling the obligation under Article 47 of the Constitution to have prohibition to check heavy drinks and use of injurious drugs."

116. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that though the Address refers to serious threat of communalism it does not indicate any action plan to root it out."

117. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the spate of communal riots which broke out as an aftermath of the demolition of Babri Masjid at Ayodhya on December 6, 1992."

118. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the repeated riots in Bombay compelling the Muslims and non-Marathi people to flee away from the city leaving behind all their dwellings and household properties."

119. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take serious note of the situation in Bombay City where the Muslim and non-Marathi workers and not allowed to join their duty by Shiv Sena workers specially in big industiral undertakings."

120. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the serious consequences of accepting the Dunkel Draft on trade negotiations."

121. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the steep fall in the value of rupee against dollar."

122. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the widening gap of the balance of payment position."

123. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the ever increasing backlog of educated unemployed persons due to the increasing rate of number of unemployed and diminishing rate of placement."

124. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's policy regarding workers' participation in management."

[Shri N. E. Balaram]

125. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to make "Right to Work" as a fundamental right."

126. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any national programme for providing old age pension for the aged living below poverty line."

127. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for a Central legislation for the welfare of the agricultural workers."

128. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take serious note of the growing incidents of atrocities on women."

129. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for creation of a Uttarakhand hill State consisting of hill districts of Uttar Pradesh such as Dehradun, Chamoli, Pauri, Garhwal, Hardwar, Nainital, Almora and Pithoragarh considering that the geographical situation social problems, languages and culture of this hill region are different from those of other parts of Uttar Pradesh."

130. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take serious note of the ever increasing public debt of the country both internal and external, and of the need to pass a legislation to limit the public debt to a certais percentage of the gross domestio product."

131. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not express serious concern over the shortage and exorbitant rise in the prices of life-saving drugs and the need to take effective measures to make life-saving drugs easily available at reasonable prices."

132. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not express serious concern over the large scale retrenchment of employees in public sector and sharp decline in employment opportunities as a result of the implementation of the new economic policy."

133. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not express serious concern over the delay in the creation of a separate tribal State comprising Adivasi dominated areas of Chhotanagpur and Santhal parganas in Bihar."

134. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not express serious concern over fast declining employment opportunities for SC & ST candidates in public sector undertakings including Banks, Insurance, Hotels, Tourism etc. as a consequence of the new industrial and economic policy which is more for privatisation thereby restricting the scope of availing reservation."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 135 to 142, by Shri Mentay Padmanabham. He is not here. Amendment Nos. 143 to 162, by Shri Viren J. Shah. He is also not here.

PROF. SOURIN BHATTACHARYA (West Bengal): Sir, I move:

163. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention as to how the Government has reduced this Address to a nullity by enforcing policy decisions immediately before it."

164. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to take note of the deliberate failure of the Government to prevent the demolition of Babri Masjid in spite of forewarning regarding preparation for the demolition and the presence of the para-military forces in adequate number in the area where they had to remain helpless spectators to the demolition work for hours together and the building of a makeshift Ramlala temple on the site."

165. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to highlight the dependence of the country's economy on Fund-Bank, Foreign Multinationals and National Monopolies because of the Government's so-called economic reforms and liberalisation."

166. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to highlights the sacrifices of the workers' service security and creating gradual dwindling of workforce of the country through the closing down of public undertakings or rationalisation of such undertakings."

167. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to take note of making the Indian Foreign Policy subservient to U.S. implerialism."

168. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to take note of Government's failure to declare the supply of essential commodities to those below the poverty line at a subsidised rate and to others at a reasonable price through public distribution system."

169. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to take note of Government's failure to ensure Education upto the age of 14 years as a fundamental right."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 170 to 178, by Shri Yashwant Sinha. He is not here.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Sir, I move:

179. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention the steps to be taken for relief and rehabilitation of the Bombay riot victims."

180. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention any steps to reduce the prices of essential commodities."

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, I move:

181. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to control price rise."

182. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for the constitution of a Joint Parliamentary Committee for examining Dunkel Draft before any decision is taken in this regard."

183. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that owing to unp

[Shri Dipen Ghosh]

dented liberalisation of import, there is going to be crisis in the Balance of Payment."

184. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to make small savings more attractive as against Mutual Funds."

185. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to protect the Babri Masjid at Ayodhya."

186. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the atrocities on women."

187. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the increasing number of dowry deaths in the country particularly in Delhi."

188. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the communal situation prevailing in different parts of the country."

189. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that a number of workers are unable to join their duties in large industrial sector till now in Bombay after communal riots."

190. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that Budgetary support will be given to the Public Sector Undertakings."

191. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the distress of handloom warers of the country."

192. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about implementation of Rajiv-Longowal accord, within one year to solve the Punjab problem."

193. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention the growingly formidable unemployment situation in the country."

194. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Addres fails to mention the need to refer the Ayodhya issue to Supreme Court under Article 138(2) of the Constitution."

195. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention the need to start political process in Kashmir without delay."

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I move:

196. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the hike in administered prices of coal and sugar and introduction of dual pricing of kerosene and LPG on the eve of the Budget Session and by-passing the Parliament."

197. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to prevent and control the communal riots in Bombay, Surat, Bhopal and other parts of the country."

198. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to protect the Babri Masjid which was demolished on 6-12-92.

199. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to provide budgetary support to the Public Sector Undertakings."

200. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the rise in prices of essential commodities."

201. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to strengthen Public Distribution System in view of rise in prices of essential commodities.

202. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about large-scale fleeing of workers belonging to different States from Bombay following the riots and stopping of non-Marathi workers from coming back to duty at big industrial establishments by Shiv Sena workers."

203. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that Budgetary support cal facts in the text books in certain States."

204. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the atrocities being committed on SC & ST and other weaker sections of the society including backward classes in different parts of the country."

205. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the atrocities being committed on women including bridge burning in different parts of the country."

206. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about large-scale land subsidence which are taking place in Raniganj-Asansol area due to unscientific coal mining and about the urgent need to save the life and property of the people of that area."

207. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the serious unemployment problem of the country which is growing day by day due to the Government's policy."

208. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the urgent need to withdraw the Exit Policy and New industrial Policy in the interest of the country."

209. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the constitution of a Joint Parliamentary Committee to go into the Dunkel Draft that our country's interest could be protected."

[Shri Sukomal Sen]

210. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the large number of sick industrial units and their increasing number day by day due to which the number of unemployed persons of the country is also increasing."

211. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely.—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the large scale retrenchment of workers, lock-outs closures in a large number of industrial units of the country and failure of the Government to protect the interests of the workers."

212. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

'but regret that the Address fails to mention that there is an urgent need for modernisation of HSCO,, West Bengal which is pending for a long time."

213. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for modernisation of Refractory and Ceramic units of Burn Standard Company Ltd., Cycle Corporation of India, Bharat Opthalmic Glass Ltd., M.A.M.C., Rehabilitation Industrial Corporation."

214. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for modernisation of engineering units of Bharat Bhari Udyog Ltd."

215. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that despite imposing ban on certain organisations, they are still active as they were before the ban."

216. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about modernisation of NTC mills."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 217 to 223, by Shri Shivprasad Chanpuria. He is not here.

SHRI ASHIS SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I beg to move:

224. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to extinguish fire in 100 coal mines in Jharia in Bihar, in Raniganj in West Bengal and in Madhya Pradesh thus salvaging millions tonne of coal valued at rupees 1000 crores."

225. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to set up Damodar Action Plan on the line of Ganga Action Plan."

226. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely.—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to implement the recommendations made in the Report of the Ghatoar Committee on Revival of sick Public Sector Industries, set up by the Labour Ministry."

227. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to implement the Report of the Labour Ministry's Committee on Rural Labourers."

228. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Gov-

ernment to initiate full-fledged land reforms in the country."

229. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to protect and promote the interest of children."

230. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to achieve full literacy."

231. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to revive IISCO."

232. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure the Government to prevent accidents, including fatal accidents on railways, highlights of which, is fatal accident met by Rajdhani Express."

233. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to improve safety and welfare in coal mines and other mines of the country."

234. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to convene the 8th National Conference on Safety in Mines."

235. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to recognise CLW Labour Union and RPF Association."

236. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to implement the recommendations of majority of trade unions on Trade Union Recognition and Industrial Relations."

237. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to prevent de-nationalisation of Coal Industry."

238. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to reinstate discharged railway workers inspite of assurance of the Government to do so."

239. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention anything regarding implementation of land reforms programme."

240. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the necessity of preventing increasing incident of dowry deaths."

241. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention anything regarding modernisation programme of Indian Iron Steel Company, West Bengal."

242. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about increasing atrocities on *Dalits, Harijans and Girijans*."

243. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for implementation of Rajiv-Longowal Accord."

[Shri Ashis Sen]

244. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely: –

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for Workers' Participation in Management."

245. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need for speedy implementation of the Sarkaria Commissioner's recommendations on Centre-State Relations."

246. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the severe resource crunch of the State Universities."

247. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the danger of capitation fee in colleges."

248. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the mounting unemployment problem in the country."

249. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the problem of child labour in the country."

250. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about urgent need of repair and maintenance of National Highways."

251. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the need of a national drug policy."

252. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the danger of Dunkel Draft."

253. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to prevent the demolition of Babri Masjid at Ayodhya on 6-12-1992."

254. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to prevent the construction of the so-called temple at the site of the mosque at Ayodhya which was demolished by the VHP, RSS, Bajrang Dal and others."

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, I move:

255. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the situation prevailing in Tripura following the postponement of the elections to the Tripura Legislative Assembly under the orders of the Chief Election Commissioner, which is a clear indictment of the State Government."

256. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to implement the Rajiv-Longowal Accord within a definite time frame of not more than one year."

257. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the necessity of taking political initiative for normalising the situation in Jammu & Kashmir."

258. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to prevent the demolition of Babri Masjid at Ayodhya on the 6th December, 1992."

259. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to prevent the construction of the so-called temple at the site of the mosque in Ayodhya."

260. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to obtain a decision of the Supreme Court under Article 138(2) of the Constitution on all matters which are now pending before different Courts of law."

SHRI S. MADHAVAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I move:

261. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about the recent steep increase in the price of sugar affecting the lower and middle class people very much."

262. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about the chain of reactions in the cost of production of various materials including electricity and railways that will arise due to the increase in the price of coal, affecting the people."

263. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about the recent policy changes announced by the Government in the import and the prices of LPG cylinders and kerosene which are going to create dual pricing system benefiting upper strata of the society."

264. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not take into consideration the grievances of the State Governments, particularly of the Tamil Nadu Government and about the unilateral announcement of the Government increasing the prices of rice and sugar given under the Public Distribution System which will affect the State Government's financial position greatly."

SHRIMATI SARALA MAHESHWARY (West Bengal): Sir, I move:

265. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the banning of some organisations like Rashtriya Swayam Seval Sangh, Vishwa Hindu Parishad, Bajrang Dal, Jamait-e-Islami, Islamic Sevak Sangh after the incident of December 6, but the ban could not be imposed as effectively as it should have been."

266. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about referring the Ayodhya issue to Supreme Court under Article 138(2) of the Constitution."

267. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the large number of people from Kashmir living as refugees in refugee camps and about the Government's responsibility to make proper arrangements for their rehabilitation and for a political solution of the problem of that area."

268. That at the *end* of the Motion the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the many political and economic problems of Punjab still lying unresolved and no progress has been made in the implementation of Rajiv-Longowal Accord."

[Shrimati Sarala Maheshwari]

269. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fact that in Tripura the State Government itself has created the law and order problem and on the basis of which Election Commission has decided to postpone the Elections."

270. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the communal riots that broke out after December 6 incidents, thousands of people were killed in those riots, property worth billion; of rupees, was damaged and the crimes committed against women, children and old people can never be pardoned by humanity and Government of Maharashtra have totally failed to check the riots in Bombay."

271. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fact that in most of the cases our steps moving towards indicative planning are proving to be the steps moving towards lack of planning and the way in which Government have alienated itself from the process of the building of national economy, is seen as sort of anarchy in the economy."

272. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fact that the reported rate of increase in gross domestic products, is not reflecting in raising the standard of day-to-day common life, on the contrary, our economy seems to be trapped in severe depression due to the work held up in most of the Government's projects."

273. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the problem of balance of payment being brought under control through external debt and that in order to avoid such situation government would have to take most stringent decisions with regard to its economic policies and substantial changes would have to be made in the policies which are being followed for about the last two years in the name of structural adjustment and economic stability."

274. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the decisions regarding the liberalisation of foreign exchange controls taken so far liberalising the imports to such an extent that the foreign companies can hold complete control over our indigenous market."

275. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that even the small scale industries cannot remain unscathed from the impact of the dangers likely to fall on the development of indigenous industries, as a result of the liberalised economic policies and that due to exorbitant rise in the interest rates of banks loans, production cost of the small scale industries has increased to such an extent that they are finding it difficult to sell their products in the market."

276. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that our agricultural sector is also under constant pressure of the international imperialistic forces through the Dunkel proposals."

277. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that due to the increase in the cost price of agricultural products as a result of reduction in sub-

sidy on chemical fertilizers, the income of the farmers has been badly affected."

278. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to implement the decision of the Supreme Court regarding recommendations of the Mandal Commission for the benefit of weaker sections of the society."

279. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that the basic objective of the Public Distribution System is being finished in its real terms by way of reduction in the subsidy on it.

280. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need of consultation with all the organisations connected with Consumers' movement before taking any decision about economic policies."

281. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not express any concern over the situation of decreasing number of women in the population as compared to men."

282. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that India would remain fully steadfast to its traditional policy of non-alignment."

283. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that the USA has taken UNO in its grip which is a dangerous situation for all the freedom loving countries of the World."

284. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that during the Earth Summit some countries tried of shirk their responsibilities towards environment which is very unfortunate.

285. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention that the present Government has failed to a great extent on various front such as communalism."

286. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address does not mention that the securities scam has cast a very adverse impact on our economy which indicates that there is a need for being more cautious while liberalising our economy further."

SHRI MISA P. GANESAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I move:

287. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the efforts to rescind the imposition of Hindi through Doordarshan by curtailing Tamil Programmes and introducing "Hindi" programmes in the name of National Programes."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Amendment Nos. 288 to 293, by Shri Bhupinder Singh Mann. He is not here.

The questions were proposed.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now, the Motion and the amendments thereto are open for discussion.

The House stands adjourned till 11 a.m. tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at five minutes past five of the clock, till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 3rd March, 1993.